

Agenda: **April 10, 2007 Kickoff Meeting**

- 3:30 Welcome
- 3:45 Goals and Context
- 4:00 Intended Geographic and Issue Scope
- 4:30 Break
- 4:45 CONCUR's Draft Assessment Findings and Draft Stakeholder Involvement Plan
- 5:45 Key Steps in the Planning Process
- 6:00 Overview of Some Key Inputs
- 6:15 Wrap-up and Next Steps
- 6:30 Adjourn

Primary Meeting Objectives

1. Discuss broad goals and context for Plan development
2. Describe the intended geographic scope, issue scope, and duration of the planning process
3. Initiate a trust-building dialogue between the Port of Oakland and the Port's stakeholders
4. Review and discuss CONCUR's Draft Stakeholder Assessment Findings and Draft Stakeholder Involvement Plan
5. Discuss the role of stakeholders in drafting the Plan
6. Outline next steps

Port of Oakland Maritime Air Quality Improvement Plan

Participation Guidelines to Support a Productive Workshop

- Today's focus is on sharing information; no decisions will be made at this workshop
- Format is a mix of presentation and discussion
- Please speak to today's agenda topics
- Be brief so that many viewpoints can be heard
- Speak to issues rather than personalities
- Consider other people's perspectives
- CONCUR and the Port of Oakland will digest and seriously consider today's questions and comments
- CONCUR will prepare a Key Outcomes Memorandum from the meeting, and will post it on a dedicated section of the CONCUR website

CONCUR, Inc.

3

Port of Oakland Maritime Air Quality Improvement Plan

Draft Stakeholder Assessment Findings & Draft Stakeholder Involvement Plan

CONCUR, Inc.

Tuesday, April 10, 2007



CONCUR, Inc.
1832 Second St.
Berkeley, CA 94710
510-649-8008

www.concurinc.com
concur@concurinc.net

Port of Oakland Maritime Air Quality Improvement Plan

Stakeholder Assessment Findings

CONCUR, Inc. 5

Port of Oakland Maritime Air Quality Improvement Plan
Stakeholder Assessment Findings

Stakeholder Assessment Findings

- **Background:**
 - Assessment is a key step in CONCUR's approach to crafting a stakeholder involvement process
 - Conducted 32 confidential interviews in February and March
 - Interviewees are a cross-section of stakeholders interested in Port Maritime air quality issues, including public agencies, community and environmental advocates, labor, industry, and elected officials and their staff
 - Assessment is our synthesis of findings and themes

CONCUR, Inc. 6

Port of Oakland Maritime Air Quality Improvement Plan
Stakeholder Assessment Findings

Stakeholder Assessment Findings

- Assessment interviews addressed the following topics:
 - Individual stakeholder background and interests relative to Port of Oakland maritime air quality
 - Useful approaches
 - Key issues to be addressed
 - Process design
 - Past experiences with the Port of Oakland
- Convergent views on many key points

CONCUR, Inc.

7

Port of Oakland Maritime Air Quality Improvement Plan
Stakeholder Assessment Findings

Findings: Stakeholder Interests - Plan Content

- Define the geographic scope for the Plan
- State a clear linkage between Port of Oakland and regional air quality planning
- Articulate clear goals
- Build on past efforts, incorporate ideas from “key source documents”

CONCUR, Inc.

8

Port of Oakland Maritime Air Quality Improvement Plan
Stakeholder Assessment Findings

Findings: Stakeholder Interests - Plan Content (cont'd)

- Establish specific actions targeted to each source of Port Maritime emissions
- Consider early Port actions and commitments
- Include implementation and funding strategies
- Consider an ongoing role for community involvement following Plan completion

CONCUR, Inc.

9

Port of Oakland Maritime Air Quality Improvement Plan
Stakeholder Assessment Findings

Findings: Stakeholder Interests - Planning Process

- Stakeholders should have a substantive role in actively reviewing / co-developing the Plan
- “Review and comment” alone is not considered sufficient
- Create multiple “pathways” for involvement
- Create a “standing group” as a primary sounding board

CONCUR, Inc.

10

Port of Oakland Maritime Air Quality Improvement Plan
Stakeholder Assessment Findings

Findings: Stakeholder Interests - Planning Process (cont'd)

- Provide access to Port technical consultants and to technical information
- Consider an appropriate timeline linked with related planning processes and studies

CONCUR, Inc.

11

Port of Oakland Maritime Air Quality Improvement Plan
Stakeholder Assessment Findings

Findings: Factors Contributing to Success

- Demonstrate clear leadership from Port executives
- Engage Port Commission members in Plan development and implementation
- Identify and quantify sources of air emissions

CONCUR, Inc.

12

Port of Oakland Maritime Air Quality Improvement Plan
Stakeholder Assessment Findings

Findings: Factors Contributing to Success (cont'd)

- Learn from perceived “disconnect” between expressed community concerns and past Port actions
- Achieve clarity on existing and emerging regulation

CONCUR, Inc.

13

Port of Oakland Maritime Air Quality Improvement Plan
Stakeholder Assessment Findings

Steps to Finalizing Assessment Memorandum

- CONCUR will distribute the Draft Stakeholder Assessment Memorandum by e-mail to interviewees by 12:00pm on April 12, 2007.
- CONCUR invites comments and clarifying questions from interviewees through April 26, 2007.
- CONCUR will distribute a final Stakeholder Assessment Memorandum to interviewees by May 4, 2007.
- CONCUR will post final Assessment Memorandum on the CONCUR website by May 4, 2007:
<http://www.concurinc.com/portofoakland>
- Assessment Findings are a key input to CONCUR's Draft Stakeholder Involvement Plan

CONCUR, Inc.

14

Port of Oakland Maritime Air Quality Improvement Plan

Draft Stakeholder Involvement Plan

CONCUR, Inc. 15

Port of Oakland Maritime Air Quality Improvement Plan

Draft Stakeholder Involvement Plan

- CONCUR's draft builds directly on our Assessment Findings
- Our draft outlines CONCUR's recommended structure for stakeholder involvement
- Defining "stakeholder" for this process

Process Recommendations

- Take account of regulatory context and its implications for the Port of Oakland Maritime Air Quality Improvement Plan
- Create Multiple Pathways for Stakeholder Involvement:
 - Recruit and Appoint Task Force
 - Form Work Teams
 - Convene Community Workshops
 - Provide an option to submit comments directly to the Port at any time
 - Post project documents online; track progress
 - Establish a public review and comment period when Draft Plan is completed

Process Recommendations (cont'd)

- Convene Port of Oakland Maritime Air Quality Task Force
 - Use existing Co-Chair structure
 - Key meetings to substantive tasks
 - Use consensus-building model
 - Discussion focused among Task Force members; meetings open to anyone
 - Use a transparent nomination and appointment process

Task Force Nomination and Appointment Process

- Charge of the task force:
The Task Force will provide a forum for:
 - Providing local knowledge of the impacts of Port Maritime emissions and local air quality.
 - Considering recommendations for Port of Oakland air quality improvement measures.
 - Engaging constructively with the Port of Oakland's technical consultants.
 - Recommending alternative air quality improvement measures for consideration.
 - Deliberating on the merits of proposed options and evaluating the impact of these measures.
 - Prioritizing air quality improvement measures.

Task Force Nomination and Appointment Process

- Task Force selection criteria (abbreviated):
 - Currently working in the Port of Oakland's Maritime Operations area or residing or working in West Oakland.
 - Able to bring first hand knowledge and perspective to bear.
 - Able to consider local air quality in the context of the broader regulatory framework and goods movement system.
 - Willing to express fundamental interests and to clearly convey interests.
 - Capable of working collaboratively, seeking to integrate the interests of a broad range of constituencies.
 - Committed to completing all aspects of the charge of the Task Force.
 - Able to meet at mutually convenient times.

Task Force Nomination and Appointment Process

- **Nomination and Appointment Process:**
 1. Nominations are made by submitting a nomination form to Delphine Prévost at the Port of Oakland.
 2. The Task Force Co-Chairs will evaluate nominations on the selection criteria and recommend individuals for appointment by the Port of Oakland Executive Director.*
 3. Omar Benjamin, Executive Director of the Port of Oakland, will appoint individuals to the Port of Oakland Maritime Air Quality Task Force.
 4. Appointments will be announced on May 20, 2007.
 5. The Board of Port Commissioners will be informed of the Task Force membership.
 6. The first meeting of the Task Force will be held on June 11, 2007.

*Update Note: Pursuant to Jack Broadbent's comment at the meeting on 4/10, the Air District will be reviewing nominations but will not be recommending individuals.

Process Recommendations (cont'd)

- **Convene periodic public workshops**
 - Provide updates on the planning process
 - Engage community in substantive deliberation
 - Solicit further suggestions from stakeholders
 - Build breakout group format into workshops
 - Coordinate timing, venue, and appropriate formats with community liaisons

Port of Oakland Maritime Air Quality Improvement Plan
Draft Stakeholder Involvement Plan

Process Recommendations (cont'd)

- Consider convening well-structured sessions devoted to Joint Fact-Finding
- Clearly articulate respective roles and responsibilities of the Port, Air District, and stakeholders

CONCUR, Inc.

23

Port of Oakland Maritime Air Quality Improvement Plan
Draft Stakeholder Involvement Plan

Process Recommendations (cont'd)

- Provide access to Port technical consultants
- Build on past and ongoing efforts of other groups involved in West Oakland air quality
- Closely coordinate planning process and Plan content with emerging and existing regulations

CONCUR, Inc.

24

Port of Oakland Maritime Air Quality Improvement Plan
Draft Stakeholder Involvement Plan

Steps to Finalize Stakeholder Involvement Plan

- CONCUR will digest comments from today's discussion
- CONCUR invites additional comments on the Draft Stakeholder Involvement Plan through May 4, 2007; transmit them to mires@concurinc.net
- Discussions will continue to clarify the evolving regulatory context
- We intend to finalize the Stakeholder Involvement Plan by May 15, 2007.
- CONCUR will post the final Stakeholder Involvement Plan on the CONCUR website:
<http://www.concurinc.com/portofoakland>

CONCUR, Inc.

25