

## **Final Stakeholder Involvement Plan**

### **Port of Oakland Maritime Air Quality Improvement Plan**

#### **A. Context for the Port of Oakland Maritime Air Quality Planning Effort**

On April 10, 2007, the Port of Oakland (Port) launched a stakeholder involvement effort to develop a Port of Oakland Maritime Air Quality Improvement Plan (MAQIP). The planning effort will be undertaken in collaboration with the Bay Area Air Quality Management District (BAAQMD) to ensure that the Port of Oakland's Plan will be well integrated with efforts to improve air quality in the larger Bay Area.

The Port of Oakland seeks broad participation from a cross-section of Port stakeholders, including neighboring residents and community-based organizations, Port of Oakland tenants and those involved in Port of Oakland Maritime operations, local business interests, public agencies, elected officials and their staffs, labor interests, and environmental advocacy organizations.

#### **B. Context for this Stakeholder Involvement Plan**

This document builds on the findings of CONCUR's Stakeholder Assessment Memorandum. We have taken the findings of that Assessment Memorandum in combination with our professional experience to develop the recommendations that follow for structuring stakeholder involvement for the Port of Oakland's MAQIP.

This Stakeholder Involvement Plan was distributed on April 10, 2007 in draft form. Comments from stakeholders were invited through May 4, 2007. The comments received have been incorporated into this document.

Definition of "stakeholder" for this process: *A stakeholder is any person that has an interest in the outcome of the Port of Oakland's planning process to develop a Port of Oakland MAQIP.*

#### **C. Process Recommendations**

##### **1. Create Multiple Pathways for Stakeholder Involvement in Developing the Plan**

Create several pathways for stakeholders to participate in the development of the MAQIP, based on their level of interest and available time. These pathways include the following:

- Participating on the Port of Oakland Maritime Air Quality Task Force (see description below);
- Making nominations to the Port of Oakland Maritime Air Quality Task Force;
- Attending Port of Oakland Maritime Air Quality Task Force meetings;
- Providing comments or suggestions at Port of Oakland Maritime Air Quality Task Force meetings;
- Attending periodic workshops designed to provide progress updates and engage community members in discussion;

- Reading process documents posted on the CONCUR website at:  
<http://www.concurinc.com/portofoakland> and the Port of Oakland website at:  
[http://www.portofoakland.com/enviro/m/prog\\_04c.asp](http://www.portofoakland.com/enviro/m/prog_04c.asp)
- Submitting comments or suggestions at any time during the planning process via mail to Delphine Prévost, Port of Oakland, Environmental Programs and Safety, Social Responsibility Division, 530 Water St., Oakland CA 94607 or via e-mail to [dprevost@portoakland.com](mailto:dprevost@portoakland.com); and
- Submitting comments during the public comment period following completion of a Draft Port of Oakland MAQIP.

## **2. Convene a Port of Oakland Maritime Air Quality Task Force**

A “standing stakeholder group” (we use the phrase “Task Force” in the rest of this document) of approximately 20 to 30 individuals will be formed to provide input on development of the MAQIP. Task Force members will be asked to make a commitment to attend plenary Task Force meetings and potential Work Team meetings through approximately February 2008. Task Force members will be appointed to achieve a balanced representation of stakeholder interest groups.

Task Force meetings will be agenda-driven and discussion will be focused among Task Force members. Task Force meetings will also be open to the public, and each Task Force meeting will include a period for public comments and suggestions.

The Task Force may make recommendations for MAQIP content, draft MAQIP text, deliberate the merits of possible air quality improvement measures, identify and discuss goals for the planning process, identify evaluation criteria for selecting measures, and other tasks as appropriate. While the Task Force will use a consensus-building model, dissenting views may be documented within Task Force recommendations.

To the maximum extent possible, Task Force venues will alternate between Port and West Oakland meeting facilities.

## **3. Convene Periodic Workshops to Report Progress and Engage a Large Number of Stakeholders**

As draft elements of the MAQIP are completed, but no less than three times over the duration of the planning process, the Port of Oakland will convene community workshops to:

- Provide updates on the planning process and
- Solicit further suggestions from stakeholders.

These community workshops will be facilitated by the CONCUR team. We anticipate that breakout groups will be a useful structure in at least some of the community workshops to provide opportunities for broad participation. The CONCUR facilitation team will work with Task Force Co-Chairs to identify appropriate workshop meeting venues and times, devise appropriate formats, conduct workshop preparations, and identify breakout group facilitators. We anticipate that to maximize participation it will be important to convene these meetings at various locations; we recommend that the workshops alternate between Port and West Oakland meeting facilities and that the workshops be held during evening time slots.

Suggestions and feedback resulting from Community Workshops will be summarized and made available to Task Force members to inform their deliberation. These comments will be incorporated into the planning process along with Task Force recommendations.

#### **4. Focus on Primary Task Force Members and Their Alternates**

The intent is to focus Task Force meeting discussion on the appointed members to maintain the continuity of deliberations. Task Force members may designate a primary alternate to serve when they are not available. Alternates are expected to meet the same selection criteria as primary representatives. Task Force members will be responsible for keeping their alternates “up to speed” so that they can participate effectively when needed.

#### **5. Use a Transparent Task Force Nomination and Appointment Process**

The Task Force Co-Chairs launched a Task Force nomination and appointment process on April 10, 2007. *See Appendix A – “Port of Oakland Maritime Air Quality Task Force Nomination and Appointment Process.”*

Descriptions of the Task Force nomination process and submittal instructions, as well as the nomination form were distributed in hard copy to public locations throughout West Oakland, as well as distributed via community e-mail listserves, Port of Oakland tenant and customer listserves, and posted on both the CONCUR and Port websites. Task Force recruitment explicitly reached out to representatives who bring an important environmental justice and economic equity perspective.

#### **6. Clearly Articulate the Respective Roles and Responsibilities of the Port of Oakland, BAAQMD, and Stakeholders**

##### Port of Oakland

- The Port of Oakland Board of Commissioners will be responsible for approving the final content of the MAQIP. Task Force members and other stakeholders will be asked to make recommendations to the Port, but will not be asked to formally vote on the final MAQIP content. The Task Force and Port staff will strive for a broad-based agreement on the elements of the MAQIP. In the event consensus cannot be reached on some MAQIP elements, multiple options may be forwarded to the Board of Port Commissioners for discussion, guidance, or final decision. CONCUR recommends that the Port give considerable weight to consensus Task Force recommendations. Task Force Co-Chairs will provide periodic briefings on the MAQIP status to the Port Commission.
- The Port will be represented on the Task Force by its Executive Director or by his alternates when he is unavailable. Additional Port staff will not be formally appointed to the Task Force, but will actively participate in and support Task Force deliberations

##### Bay Area Air Quality Management District (BAAQMD)

- The Air District will be a key partner in linking the Port’s planning process to the Air District’s regional effort, in providing regulatory guidance and technical assistance to the Task Force, and where appropriate, helping to leverage financial support for implementation of the MAQIP. The BAAQMD will be represented on the Task Force by its Executive Officer or by his alternates in the event he is unavailable. Additional BAAQMD staff may participate in Task Force deliberations as needed.

## Stakeholders

- Task Force members will serve in an active advisory role. Their charge includes proposing or reviewing options, co-developing MAQIP elements, ranking measures for consideration, deliberating the merits of proposed actions, and contributing to strategies for implementation, monitoring, and adaptive management. For MAQIP items or elements for which consensus is not reached, CONCUR recommends that Task Force recommendations be provided, as written, to the Port of Oakland Board of Commissioners for their consideration (see above).
- Stakeholders who are not members of the Task Force will also participate in an advisory role, engaging according to their preferences through the various pathways available for reviewing MAQIP documents and providing comments and suggestions.
- The current thinking is that formats for stakeholder deliberation will include elicitive brainstorming on goals and objectives as well as screening metrics and considering air quality improvement measures.

## **7. Explicitly State the Geographic Focus and Intended Linkage to Regional Air Quality Planning**

The primary geographic focus of the planning effort will be the Port of Oakland Maritime Operations Area and West Oakland. For the purpose of the planning process, West Oakland is geographically defined as the “3-freeway area” between I-880, I-980, and I-580. The secondary focus, as appropriate, will be considering the impacts of air quality improvement measures on nearby communities that are outside the West Oakland and Port Maritime Operations Areas. The planning process will be explicitly linked to the Bay Area Air Quality Management District’s regional effort through the Co-Chair structure and close coordination between the Port of Oakland’s planning process and the BAAQMD’s emerging regulatory program.

## **8. Define the Role of Task Force Co-Chairs**

The Task Force will be Co-Chaired by three individuals:

Omar Benjamin (Executive Director, Port of Oakland)

Jack Broadbent (Executive Officer, Bay Area Air Quality Management District)

Margaret Gordon (Co-Chair, West Oakland Environmental Indicators Project)

Co-Chairs will be members of the Task Force and will be involved in co-planning meetings, providing process suggestions, and reviewing agendas and other key process documents produced by the CONCUR facilitation team.

CONCUR facilitators will guide the discussion at plenary Task Force meetings, prepare key process documents, liaise with Port technical consultants, and draft Key Outcomes Memoranda for each Task Force meeting and Community Workshop.

Co-Chairs will appoint primary and secondary alternates to serve in their absence. These alternates will act on behalf of the Co-Chair to represent the same constituency and will have decision-making authority when the Co-Chair is not available.

CONCUR recommends that the Co-Chairs consider the merits of creating a planning structure that includes a representative of industry interests. This could be accomplished by adding a fourth Co-Chair or by creating a steering committee that includes the 3 Co-Chairs and an industry representative.

### **9. Identify the Expected Duration of Planning Process**

The planning process is expected to last 9 to 12 months. Task Force members will make an initial commitment from June 2007 through February 2008. The Task Force members' commitment is currently expected to end when the MAQIP is finalized and approved by the Port's Board of Commissioners. Task Force members may be asked to contribute as needed during implementation and monitoring.

### **10. Set the Anticipated Meeting Frequency**

- Task Force Meetings: Plenary meetings of the Task Force will be about a half day in length and will occur at approximately 6-8 week intervals. As needed, Task Force members may meet in ad hoc Work Teams between plenary Task Force meetings to complete specific tasks.
- Community Workshops: There will be at least three community workshops scheduled over the duration of the planning process. These will be timed to optimize opportunities for substantive engagement during the workshops.

### **11. Consider the Merits of Convening Stakeholder Joint Fact-Finding Sessions to Build the Knowledge Base for Maritime Air Quality Planning**

The stakeholder involvement process will bring together diverse interests from the West Oakland community, Port Maritime industries, and public agencies. While many representatives from these groups have had limited interaction with one another to date, they will be asked to collaborate closely during Plan development.

As the air quality planning process progresses, CONCUR recommends that the Task Force consider the merits of convening a Joint Fact-Finding session (either as a regular Task Force meeting or as an optional session between Task Force meetings) to create a venue for representatives of the Port of Oakland, West Oakland residents, various Maritime industries (including rail, trucking, shipping, terminal operations and others), the environmental community, and technical experts to share more detailed information about the basis of their interests and to build a foundation of mutual understanding as they consider the merits of various air quality improvement measures.

### **12. Define the Role and Composition of Work Teams**

Ad hoc Work Teams will be formed as needs arise at the Task Force. CONCUR recommends that necessary Work Teams be formed to meet between plenary Task Force meetings to engage specific topics at a deeper level. These Work Teams will form and meet as-needed to accomplish Plan development; they will not be standing committees of the Task Force.

Work Teams will be charged with completing specific tasks (outlining concepts, drafting text, conducting focused research, deliberating options) and bringing results to the plenary Task Force for consideration. The full Task Force will discuss initial Work Team representation, task focus, and expected work products when the Work Team is formed.

All Work Team drafts will be subject to review and deliberation by the full Task Force. Dissenting views within the Work Teams will also be reported to the full Task Force. Some Work Team products may be incorporated in the Draft Port of Oakland Maritime Air Quality Improvement Plan; others may not, depending on the deliberations of the full Task Force and consideration by the Port.

Composition of the work teams will be guided by:

- Substantive interests and knowledge of the Task Force members
- Striving for diverse constituency representation on each Work Team
- Providing for any interested Task Force member to attend any Work Team meeting

Until they are presented to the full Task Force, interim Work Team products will be considered internal working drafts, and will not be broadly distributed. While Work Teams will consist primarily of Task Force members, some Work Teams may find it advantageous to include some stakeholders who are not serving as Task Force members. The current intent is for the Work Team structure to be flexible and adaptive; the intent is not to create a formal subcommittee structure. Facilitation and guidance of Work Teams will be determined as they are formed; some may be facilitated by CONCUR; others may be guided by Port staff or a Task Force member, who may serve as lead for a Work Team.

### **13. Describe the Role of the Port's Technical Consultants and Provide Access to Technical Consultants**

The Port of Oakland's technical consultants will plan to attend all plenary Task Force meetings and all Community Workshops. They will also attend Work Team meetings as appropriate and feasible. As requested, Port technical consultants will provide updates on their work, engage in question and answer sessions with stakeholders, and be available for consultation on technical matters at Task Force Meetings.

The technical consultants will have primary responsibility for technical advising to Port staff. Port staff will in turn prepare the MAQIP for Board of Commissioners consideration, based on the contributions of and review by Task Force members, Work Teams, and other stakeholders.

The Task Force and the Port may agree that additional consultant services are needed to fulfill data needs as the planning process unfolds. In this event, the Port will evaluate budgetary conditions, and if appropriate, will ask the Task Force to provide advice in designing the work plan for the consultant and in recommending specific consultants.

Task Force members who wish to introduce additional technical or other consulting reports to Task Force meetings may do so with the consent of the Co-Chairs.

### **14. Create Ground Rules for the Conduct of the Task Force and Work Teams**

CONCUR recommends that the Task Force adopt a set of Ground Rules to create clear expectations and a framework for their interactions. CONCUR will work with Task Force members to create these Ground Rules, which would also guide Work Teams. CONCUR will provide Proposed Ground Rules to Task Force members in advance of the first Task Force meeting so that the Ground Rules can be finalized and adopted at the first meeting.

### **15. Build on Past Efforts and Consider Potential "Source Documents"**

While the Port of Oakland Maritime Air Quality Task Force would be the first group charged specifically with working to develop a Port of Oakland Maritime Air Quality Improvement Plan, there are several groups that have done previous work to analyze air quality issues in the Oakland area and recommend strategies for air quality improvement. Examples include the West Oakland Toxics Reduction Collaborative, the City of Oakland Port Task Force, the Ditching Dirty Diesel Collaborative, and the West Oakland Environmental Indicators Project.

In considering possible strategies for air quality improvement, there also exist several potential “Source Documents” that may lend useful goals, targets, and strategies to the Port of Oakland planning effort. Possible examples include the San Pedro Bay Ports Clean Air Action Plan (Ports of Los Angeles and Long Beach) and the 2006 California Air Resources Board Emission Reduction Plan for Ports and Goods Movement in California. Sources may also include past and current efforts at improving port air quality that were not part of formal air quality improvement plans.

**16. Closely Coordinate the Port of Oakland Maritime Air Quality Planning Process with Existing and Emerging Regulations**

CONCUR recommends that the Port of Oakland, Task Force, and other stakeholders stay apprised of and closely coordinate MAQIP development to incorporate existing and emerging local, state, and federal regulations. New rules from the California Air Resources Board significantly affecting ports could be completed in 2007, as well as the emerging port regulatory framework from the Bay Area Air Quality Management District (the “Green Ports Initiative”), expected in the first half of 2008.

Regular updates on regulatory developments will be provided at Task Force meetings.

**17. Designate a Port of Oakland Liaison for the Maritime Air Quality Improvement Plan:**

Delphine Prévost in the Port of Oakland’s Environmental Programs and Safety Department, Social Responsibility Division, will be the primary liaison for all matters relating to the content of Port of Oakland’s Maritime Air Quality Improvement Plan and for communication regarding MAQIP preparation. Ms. Prévost can be reached at [dprevost@portoakland.com](mailto:dprevost@portoakland.com) or 510-627-1141.

**18. Privacy and Contact Information**

A Task Force roster with complete contact information will be compiled once the Task Force is formed. This roster will be distributed to all Task Force members.

Sign-in sheets will be compiled from each Task Force meeting so that public attendees can be apprised of important developments in the planning process. No personal information regarding public attendees will be shared.

## **Appendix A**

### **Port of Oakland Maritime Air Quality Task Force Nomination and Appointment Process April 2007**

*The Port of Oakland is forming a Port of Oakland Maritime Air Quality Task Force (Task Force) to contribute to the development of the Port's Maritime Air Quality Improvement Plan. The Port and Task Force Co-Chairs seek individuals committed to contributing to the Plan's development through February 2008, and will be accepting Task Force nominations through **May 10, 2007**. Appointments will be announced by May 20, 2007, and members will be asked to attend the first Port Maritime Air Quality Task Force meeting on June 11, 2007.*

#### **Port of Oakland Maritime Air Quality Task Force**

The Port is creating the Maritime Air Quality Task Force as one method of involving stakeholders in the development of the Port of Oakland Maritime Air Quality Improvement Plan (Plan). This Task Force will work closely with the Port of Oakland's staff and technical consultants to develop the Plan. Task Force meetings will be open to the public and will provide a structure for observers to submit comments. Meetings will be agenda-driven and the primary focus of deliberations will be among the Port of Oakland Maritime Air Quality Task Force members.

The Port of Oakland Maritime Air Quality Task Force will be asked to make recommendations to the Port, but will not be asked to formally vote on the final Plan content. Concerns raised by the Port of Oakland Maritime Air Quality Task Force will be documented as part of the Plan development process.

The Port of Oakland Maritime Air Quality Task Force will be co-chaired by Omar Benjamin (Executive Director, Port of Oakland), Jack Broadbent (Executive Officer, Bay Area Air Quality Management District), and Margaret Gordon (West Oakland Environmental Indicators Project). Co-Chairs may have designees perform certain functions based on Co-Chair availability. Facilitation will be provided by CONCUR, Inc., a neutral non-partisan environmental mediation firm based locally.

#### **Charge of the Port of Oakland Maritime Air Quality Task Force**

The Task Force will provide a forum for:

- Providing local knowledge of the impacts of Port Maritime emissions and local air quality.
- Considering recommendations for Port of Oakland air quality improvement measures. These recommendations may include options developed by the Port of Oakland's technical consultants, as well as options developed in other forums (such as air quality plans from other ports or recommendations from other groups working on the issue).
- Engaging constructively with the Port of Oakland's technical consultants.
- Recommending alternative air quality improvement measures for consideration.
- Deliberating on the merits of proposed options and evaluating the impact of these measures on residents, Port Maritime operations, the City of Oakland, and the economy.
- Prioritizing air quality improvement measures based on a variety of factors including but not limited to environmental benefit, cost effectiveness, technological feasibility, and implementation phasing.

To address these and other issues in a collaborative manner, the Task Force will work with the CONCUR facilitation team. The group will meet in plenary meetings at approximately 6- to 8-week

intervals, and in Work Teams between plenary meetings, from June 2007 through February 2008. The time commitment necessary to prepare for and actively participate in the meetings and on Work Teams is likely to be substantial.

### **Criteria for Selection**

The selection of the Task Force will be structured to include balanced representation of public agency, labor, business, neighborhood, and conservation interests.

Individual members of the Task Force are expected to have the following attributes:

- Currently working in the Port of Oakland's Maritime Operations area or residing or working in West Oakland (defined geographically as the "3 freeway area" bounded by 880, 980, and 580). Individuals from non-profits, government agencies, businesses, churches, and private organizations that conduct their work in West Oakland but are not based in West Oakland will also be considered.
- Able to bring first hand knowledge and perspective to bear on Port of Oakland Maritime Air Quality planning.
- Able to consider local air quality near the Port of Oakland Maritime operations in the context of the broader regulatory framework and goods movement system.
- Willing to express fundamental interests (as opposed to fixed positions) and to clearly convey the interests of one or more important stakeholder groups.
- Capable of working collaboratively, seeking to integrate the interests of a broad range of constituencies.
- Committed to completing all aspects of the charge of the Task Force.
- Able to meet at mutually convenient times.

Recruitment will be made to achieve a diversity of stakeholder perspectives, expertise, and direct experience related to the Port's Maritime emissions. Efforts by multiple stakeholder groups to nominate a single individual are encouraged.

### **Nomination and Appointment Process:**

1. Nominations are made by submitting a nomination form to Delphine Prévost at the Port of Oakland (see submittal instructions below).
2. Task Force Co-Chairs Omar Benjamin and Margaret Gordon will review nominations based on the above selection criteria. Co-Chair Jack Broadbent may review nominations but will not recommend nominees for appointment.
3. Omar Benjamin, Executive Director of the Port of Oakland, will appoint individuals to the Port of Oakland Maritime Air Quality Task Force.
4. Appointments will be announced by May 20, 2007.
5. The Board of Port Commissioners will be informed of the Task Force membership.
6. The first meeting of the Task Force will be held on June 11, 2007.

## Nomination Submittal Instructions

- Individuals may nominate themselves.
- Use the attached nomination form to submit nominations. In the case of e-mailed nominations, send an e-mail that includes responses to all of the information requested on the nomination form.
- Statements of Support are encouraged:
  - The Port of Oakland encourages stakeholders to confer in developing nominations and brief statements of support, which can be indicated on the nomination form. These brief statements should address the selection criteria above, and/or the support for the nominee within the stakeholder community.
- Nomination forms must be submitted to Delphine Prévost at the Port of Oakland. Nominations must be *received* by 5:00 p.m. on **Thursday, May 10, 2007** at one of the following:

Email: dprevost@portoakland.com

Fax: 510-451-5916

Mail: Delphine Prévost  
Port of Oakland  
Social Responsibility Division  
Port of Oakland  
530 Water St.  
Oakland, CA 94607

**Port of Oakland Maritime Air Quality Task Force Nomination Form**  
**April 2007**

**1. NOMINEE CONTACT INFORMATION (REQUIRED)**

Name:		
Organization/Affiliation (if applicable):		
Title (in applicable):		
Address:		
City:	State:	Zip:
Telephone: (       )       -		
E-mail address:		

**2. HOW DOES THE NOMINEE MEET THE TASK FORCE SELECTION CRITERIA?**  
**(REQUIRED)**

*Selection criteria are listed on page 2 of the "Port of Oakland Maritime Air Quality Task Force Nomination and Appointment Process"*

**3. INTERESTS OF THE NOMINEE RELATIVE TO PORT OF OAKLAND MARITIME AIR QUALITY: (REQUIRED)**

**4. NOMINEE'S RELATED INVOLVEMENT / AFFILIATIONS: (IF APPLICABLE)**

a) Current and past affiliations with groups active in air quality planning or Port Maritime Operations:

b) Past involvement in similar collaborative processes to provide advice on environmental plans, policies, or regulations:

**5. NOMINEE'S AREAS OF KNOWLEDGE OR EXPERTISE RELATIVE TO THE MARITIME AIR QUALITY PLANNING PROCESS: (IF APPLICABLE)**

**6. BRIEF STATEMENTS OF SUPPORT FOR THE NOMINEE: (IF APPLICABLE)**

The following individuals support this nomination to the Port of Oakland Maritime Air Quality Task Force:

Name:	Affiliation (if applicable):
Statement of Support:	
Signature:	

Name:	Affiliation (if applicable):
Statement of Support:	
Signature:	

*\*brief statements of support from additional individuals may be submitted on additional pages using the above format*

**7. SIGNATURE OF PERSON COMPLETING THIS FORM**

**• If nomination form is submitted by nominee:**

*By signing below, I confirm that I meet all selection criteria for the Port of Oakland Maritime Air Quality Task Force. I also confirm that if appointed, I will work to fulfill the charge of the Task Force, and I commit to participating on the Task Force through February 2008.*

Signature \_\_\_\_\_ Date \_\_\_\_\_

**• If nomination form is not submitted by the nominee:**

Name of person making nomination \_\_\_\_\_ Phone \_\_\_\_\_

Signature \_\_\_\_\_ Date \_\_\_\_\_