

Proposed Ground Rules

Port of Oakland Maritime Air Quality Task Force

The following ground rules have been informed by confidential interviews conducted with a cross section of Port Maritime Air Quality stakeholders, as well as CONCUR's professional experience in convening other multistakeholder planning efforts. These ground rules are intended to foster and reinforce constructive interaction and deliberation among the Port Maritime Air Quality Task Force ("Task Force") members. They emphasize clear communication, trust building, respect for divergent views, creative thinking, collaborative problem solving, and the pursuit of mutual gains. The Task Force may decide to reconsider and revise these ground rules if they appear not to be serving the Maritime Air Quality Improvement Plan (MAQIP) process.

Task Force Nomination, Recruitment, and Representation

Task Force recruitment. Task Force nominations were invited from a broad cross section of interests. The nomination process was described at the April 10 Public Kick-off Meeting for the planning process. Descriptions of the nomination process and nomination forms were also:

- Posted on the CONCUR and Port of Oakland websites;
- Made available in several locations in West Oakland;
- Distributed via e-mail to several West Oakland community list-serves and to Port tenants.

Task Force Selection. Members have been appointed by the Executive Director of the Port of Oakland (Port). Task Force Co-Chairs Omar Benjamin and Margaret Gordon reviewed nominations and recommended nominees for appointment. (Task Force Co-Chair Jack Broadbent reviewed nominations but did not make specific recommendations on nominees.) Taken together, appointments were made to achieve a diversity of stakeholder perspectives, expertise, and ability to represent an important set of stakeholder interests, in accordance with the stated Task Force selection criteria.

Representation

- **Task Force Members.** Task Force members are appointed by Port Executive Director Omar Benjamin. Once appointed, Task Force members may choose to identify one alternate to participate on their behalf when unavailable. Alternates are expected to meet the same selection criteria as primary members, and will be confirmed by Port Executive Director Omar Benjamin.
- **Port and Bay Area Air Quality Management District (BAAQMD) Staff.** The Port and the BAAQMD are primarily represented through their Co-Chairs. Additional Port and BAAQMD staff will not be formally appointed as members of the Task Force, but will actively participate to inform and support Task Force deliberation.
- **Seating at Task Force Meetings.** During Task Force meetings, the following participants will be seated at the main table: Task Force members, Co-Chairs and their alternates, selected Port of Oakland and Bay Area Air Quality Management District staff as appropriate, technical consultants as appropriate, and project facilitators. Support staff, members of the public, and Task Force alternates in attendance will be seated adjacent to the main table.

Participation and Collaboration

Task Force members.

- Task Force members will make every effort to attend all of the Task Force meetings. Alternates are also encouraged to attend meetings in order to stay current with Task Force deliberations.
- Task Force members will work with their alternates to ensure that alternates are informed regarding Task Force deliberations. This will enable alternates to step in effectively as needed and keep the planning process moving forward.
- Discussion at Task Force meetings will principally involve Task Force members, Port and BAAQMD staff as appropriate, and technical consultants as appropriate.
- **Active, focused participation.** Every participant is responsible for communicating his/her perspectives and interests on the issues under consideration. Voicing these perspectives is essential to enable meaningful dialogue. Everyone will participate with no one dominating. Only one person will speak at a time. Everyone will help keep the meetings on track.
- **Respectful interaction.** Participants will respect each other's personal integrity, values and legitimacy of interests. Participants will avoid personal attacks and stereotyping.
- **Integration and creative thinking.** In developing, reviewing and revising work products, participants will strive to be open-minded and to integrate each other's ideas, perspectives and interests. Disagreements will be regarded as problems to be solved rather than battles to be won. Participants will attempt to reframe contentious issues and offer creative solutions to enable constructive dialogue.
- **Mutual gains approach.** Participants will work to satisfy not only their own interests but also those of other Task Force members. Participants are encouraged to be clear about their own interests and to recognize the important distinction between underlying interests and fixed positions.
- **Commitment to ground rules.** As a set of mutual obligations, Task Force members will commit to adhere to these ground rules once they are ratified. Task Force members are encouraged to help uphold and enforce these ground rules. If a Task Force member consistently deviates from these ground rules, that member may be replaced by another person upon confirmation by the Executive Director of the Port of Oakland.

Commitment to process

- Participants will make a good faith effort to achieving the goals of the planning process according to the proposed schedule. Goals of the process include developing for the Port Commission's consideration a MAQIP, which will articulate goals and objectives, identify candidate air quality improvement actions, and identify implementation and ongoing strategies for monitoring and adaptive management.
- Participants will review available meeting materials in advance of the meetings and come prepared to address the meeting objectives.

- Meetings will start on time to make full use of the allotted time. Task Force members agree to participate for the full duration of Task Force meetings. Participants who know that they will be absent will coordinate with their alternates as needed.
- Cell phones and pagers will be turned off or set to “silent” mode during Task Force meetings.

Task Force Decision Rules

- Task Force members recognize the need to make simple process agreements to move the effort forward. Task Force facilitators may use “straw votes” to track progress and help the group arrive at short-term decisions to propel the process forward in an efficient fashion.
- Task Force members will strive to achieve a high level of consensus in developing and advancing recommendations for the Port MAQIP. The intent is to strive for recommendations that earn broad support across Task Force members’ interests, not to accord Task Force members a “de facto” veto on substantive issues. Unanimity will not be required, and the objection of a few Task Force members will not be grounds to impede movement.

Multi-interest Work Teams

- The Task Force Co-Chairs recognize that cross-interest group Work Teams may be an essential way to develop constructive, integrative work products between Task Force meetings. The aim of such Work Teams is to encourage multi-interest options and work products rather than work products put forward by a single bloc or interest group.
- Work Teams will be composed to include appropriate knowledge and balance of interests.

Media Contact

- The Task Force may convene a multi-interest media subcommittee to work with Port staff to present briefings for the media.
- Task Force members recognize the need to maintain a balance between informing others of their work and making statements to the media that could undermine the success of the MAQIP process. Appropriate topics for Task Force members to address in speaking to the media include their own group’s or personal interests. Task Force members agree not to: a) make statements to the media that may prejudice the planning outcome, b) represent another group’s point of view or characterize their motives, c) state positions on preliminary proposals while they are still in development or refinement by work teams or by the Task Force, or d) attempt to represent or speak for the entire Task Force.
- In sharing information about Task Force progress, Task Force members are encouraged to rely primarily on the Key Outcomes Memoranda for the meetings, produced by the CONCUR facilitation team.

Public Comment

- Designated times at each Task Force meetings will be agendized for public comment. Efforts will be made to hold public comment at consistent time slots and keyed to important Task Force work product discussions.
- To the extent possible, public comments will be directed toward the work effort, products, or process of the Task Force. Comments on subjects external to the Port MAQIP should be directed to other forums.
- Members of the public are encouraged to convey their comments to relevant colleagues who serve as Task Force members. Members of the public are also encouraged to submit comments directly to the Port in writing as outlined in the Stakeholder Involvement Plan. Written comments will be distributed to Task Force members.
- The Task Force facilitation team will exercise flexibility in allocating speaking time during public comment periods to optimize opportunities to hear a range of views.

Information Sharing and Joint Fact-Finding

- Task Force members recognize that the MAQIP planning process relies on using the best readily available information.
- Task Force meetings will present multiple opportunities for data sharing and joint fact-finding, either in plenary or in Work Team meetings.
- Task Force members agree to be specific in identifying types of information they believe will be useful support the development of recommendations. Task Force members commit to share, and not withhold, relevant information to inform Task Force deliberations.
- Task Force Work Teams may develop preliminary recommendations, which should be treated as tentative and private until they have been presented to the Task Force.
- In the event that two or more data sets or interpretations appear to conflict, participants will work collaboratively with each other and with participating technical consultants to narrow and clarify the basis of disagreement.

Role of Facilitation Team

- The Task Force facilitation team is non-partisan. A broad-based selection committee unanimously chose the facilitation team; they have no stake in any particular recommendations of the Task Force. They will not act as an advocate for particular outcomes. The facilitators will strive to ensure that all Task Force members clearly articulate their respective interests and to assist members to complete their work in a well-informed and efficient fashion.
- The facilitation team will use its discretion in guiding meetings and may propose agenda adjustments. The facilitation team may also use straw voting to track a range of preferences on emerging issues. The facilitation team will also exercise flexibility in allocating speaking time.
- The Task Force facilitation team will prepare Key Outcomes Memoranda to summarize the main results of the Task Force meetings. These Key Outcomes Memoranda will not strive to serve as a transcript of the meetings; rather, they will endeavor to summarize key decisions made, issues discussed, and the next steps identified for moving the planning process forward. The facilitators will strive to prepare Key Outcomes Memoranda within 7-10 days of the meetings.