

**Date:** August 21, 2007

**To:** Attendees, August 14, 2007 Port of Oakland Maritime Air Quality Plan Task Force Meeting

**From:** Scott McCreary and Jon Mires, CONCUR, Inc.

**Re:** Key Outcomes Memorandum – August 14, 2007 Port of Oakland Maritime Air Quality Improvement Plan Task Force Meeting

---

Below is a summary of the August 14, 2007, MAQIP Task Force Meeting. This summary provides a listing of the primary issues raised during the discussion. It is not intended to serve as a meeting transcript.

**BACKGROUND:**

This second meeting of the MAQIP Task Force was convened at the Waterfront Plaza Hotel in Oakland. Over 40 Task Force members and their alternates attended the meeting, as well as Port and Bay Area Air Quality Management District staff, Port technical consultants, and interested members of the public. The meeting was facilitated by CONCUR, Inc.

All meeting materials and handouts referenced in this document are available on both the CONCUR and Port of Oakland websites:

- CONCUR website: <http://www.concurinc.com/portofoakland/>
- Port of Oakland website: [http://www.portofoakland.com/environm/prog\\_04c.asp](http://www.portofoakland.com/environm/prog_04c.asp)

**BRIEFINGS AND UPDATES:**

Several briefings and updates were provided to Task Force members. These included the following:

- Andy Garcia of GSC Logistics was introduced as the new Co-Chair representing industry/business interests.
- Port of Oakland project manager Delphine Prévost described how the MAQIP had been structurally refined in response to Task Force comments at the June 11 meeting. These refinements included placing public health at the core of the planning effort, placing an emphasis on risk reduction, and shifting to a performance-based approach that provides flexibility in the method to achieve the to-be-determined emission and risk reduction objectives. The refinements had implications for several of the planning documents, including the Draft Table of Contents and the Key Milestones for MAQIP development. Updated versions of these documents were provided as handouts.
- Co-Chairs presented a recommendation that the MAQIP use a health risk reduction objective, track the risk reduction through corresponding emission reductions, and link the emission reduction back to the expected health benefit to evaluate progress. The recommendation also calls for leadership and coordination among public agencies with relevant resources and expertise to update risk studies. The Co-Chair recommendation is reflected on slide #62 of the Compendium of PowerPoint Slides.
- Port staff and technical consultants presented information on setting risk reduction objectives, including identifying the health impact and area of impact, the baseline emissions and associated risk, and projected emissions. Emissions and emissions reduction forecasts incorporated expected seaport growth and existing and pending regulations, emphasizing those projections related to emissions only, not to risk. It was noted that the Health Risk Assessment will be key in forecasting associated risk reductions.
- Port staff also presented on seaport activity and growth projections, noting that the “medium” scenario is the most likely to occur and would be the focal point of the planning effort (refer to slide #68 of the Compendium of PowerPoint Slides).

- Carolyn Suer of the Air Resources Board (ARB) presented background information on how the ARB developed its statewide risk reduction goal, including a description of how different emissions sources are weighted in relation to health risk.
- The facilitation team introduced the Source Document Work Team's compiled list of Candidate Actions Drawn From Source Documents. The list is intended as a starting point for Task Force discussion, and Task Force members will be asked to add potential measures to the list at the September Task Force meeting.
- Delphine Prévost provided a brief overview of the August 1 educational workshop "Seaport Operations and Air Quality," hosted by the Port of Oakland and the Bay Area Air Quality Management District.
- Dr. Tony Iton, Director of the Alameda County Public Health Department (ACPHD), presented on the relationship between public health, environmental quality, and social equity. He also presented detailed information about public health indicators in West Oakland and the health costs of goods movement. The presentation focused on health disparities in Alameda County, and recommended a holistic approach addressing social inequities and power sharing between institutions and communities in addition to technical solutions for reducing emissions.
- Jean Roggenkamp of the Bay Area Air Quality Management District (BAAQMD) gave a brief summary of data from the BAAQMD's CARE program, showing emissions of diesel particulate matter and asthma hospitalization rates for children 14 and under.

#### **KEY DELIBERATION ITEMS:**

Adoption of Guiding Principles and Goals: Port staff and Co-Chairs introduced revised Guiding Principles and Goals, modified in response to extensive stakeholder comments at the June 11 Task Force meeting. Task Force members suggested several text edits to the revised items as well as clarifying and recasting sections H through L of the Goals as "Sideboards" or "Constraints." The Task Force then adopted the Guiding Principles and Goals with these revisions. The adopted document will be available on the Port of Oakland and CONCUR websites the week of September 3.

Discussion and Revision of Draft Screening Criteria: Delphine Prévost described the Draft Screening Criteria, which will be used to screen potential measures into the MAQIP. Task Force members engaged in a robust discussion of the criteria, including how they will relate to other MAQIP elements. Task Force members proposed several revisions to the existing criteria as well as several new criteria. Port staff and Co-Chairs will digest and consider these comments and bring back a revised set of criteria to the September Task Force meeting for deliberation and adoption.

#### **KEY QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS:**

Several aspects of the performance-based approach led to questions about monitoring and implementation. Task Force members sought more information or requested future discussion on the process for forming agency partnerships, tracking health outcomes, updating risk studies, and implementing MAQIP elements; the Task Force role in setting performance objectives; the timeline for meeting MAQIP objectives and the enforcement mechanism when objectives are not met; and identifying whether monitoring would involve emissions only or would include ambient air quality. All of these items were flagged for further consideration when monitoring and implementation are agendaized at future Task Force meetings.

Several comments were made in response to both the overview of the Port's Draft 2005 Emissions Inventory and the Air Resources Board's (ARB) Draft Inventory of Diesel Particulate Matter (DPM) for the West Oakland Health Risk Assessment (HRA), which includes the Port, UP Rail yard, and West Oakland sources:

- Port 2005 Draft Emissions Inventory: The inventory was distributed August 8, and comments are invited

by the Port through August 24. The relatively short comment period is attributed to finalizing the inventory soon so the ARB can proceed with modeling work for the HRA. Several questions were raised about the assumptions used in comparing the Port of Oakland Emissions Inventory to other ports and the Bay Area region. One Task Force alternate commented that given the level of uncertainty with developing emissions inventories, a range of emissions would be more accurate than a single number. It was also suggested that due to the significant increase in cargo volume expected at the Port, emissions projections should include expected construction emissions from development projects.

- ARB Draft Inventory of DPM for the West Oakland HRA: On August 21, The ARB will convene a separate meeting specifically addressing the three parts of the emissions inventory that serve as a basis for the West Oakland HRA: Port of Oakland seaport, Union Pacific Rail Yard, and sources in West Oakland. This meeting will be at 6:00 pm at the West Oakland Senior Center. It was noted during both the presentations and comments that the West Oakland emissions may be overstated and the Port of Oakland emissions understated due to the location to which emissions for some trucks serving the Port are attributed. Port staff noted that the Port and the ARB are currently reviewing this issue.

Following a presentation about the relationship between emissions and health risk, a question was raised about whether the relationship is linear, or whether some other function better describes the relationship. It was noted that the ARB used a linear function in setting its risk reduction goal. Another question was posed as to whether asthma will be addressed in relating to emissions to health risk and exposure, or whether the focus will be solely on cancer risk. Task Force member Swati Prakash of the Pacific Institute also introduced a supplemental handout relating emissions to risk.

Discussion of an overview of emission control technologies will be deferred to a future meeting. Task Force members are invited to review the relevant slides on their own in the meantime (refer to slides #88 – 101 of the Compendium of PowerPoint slides).

Tony Iton's presentation sparked a spirited discussion among Task Force members. Many Task Force members expressed a desire for ACPHD to stay actively involved and engaged with the MAQIP planning process. There were several requests for ACPHD to conduct additional analyses at the local level. One potential assessment might look at quantifying health care costs of goods movement locally. Dr. Iton responded that his agency would be willing to do analysis and support the planning process in the ways that it can. He also noted that ACPHD is represented on the Task Force.

One Task Force member requested that the planning team explore stipends for those Task Force members who are missing work and are not paid when they attend Task Force meetings.

A member of the public suggested that Task Force meetings be held at a location in West Oakland rather than at the hotel used for this meeting.

Port staff sought suggestions for supplemental workshops. These workshops would be optional and educational in nature; no decisions regarding the MAQIP will be made at the workshops. Suggestions provided by Task Force members included a presentation of the West Oakland Environmental Indicators Project and West Oakland Toxics Reduction Collaborative recommendations, a presentation on exposure pathways, a Port presentation giving more detail about its legal authority and influence, a workshop on health care solutions and responsibility, and a workshop on ideas for improving hope and resilience in West Oakland through MAQIP actions. Additional suggestions are invited and may be submitted to Jon Mires at CONCUR (see "Summary of Next Steps below"). CONCUR will compile the suggestions for consideration by the Co-Chairs.

**SUMMARY OF NEXT STEPS:**

<b>Responsible Party</b>	<b>Action</b>	<b>Timeline</b>
CONCUR	• Finalize and Distribute Key Outcomes Memorandum.	Week of 8/20
Port and CONCUR	• Incorporate revisions to Adopted Guiding Principles and Goals • Distribute Adopted Guiding Principles and Goals	Week of 8/27 Week of 9/3
Port	• Revise Draft Screening Criteria based on stakeholder comments.	By 9/20
Port	• Distribute revised Screening Criteria to Task Force members, for adoption at Sept. 27 meeting.	9/20
Task Force members	• Suggest supplemental educational workshop topics to Jon Mires at CONCUR: mires@concurinc.net or 510-649-8008.	By 8/31
Task Force members	• Suggest additional terms for the Glossary and Acronyms list to Delphine Prévost: dprevost@portoakland.com or 510-627-1141.	Ongoing
Task Force members	• Develop specific additional potential air quality initiatives, to suggest during brainstorming on Sept. 27.	By 9/27
Co-Chairs and CONCUR	• Consider and confirm agreement on the framing and content of candidate agenda items for Sept. 27 meeting.	By 9/20
Co-Chairs and CONCUR	• Identify and agree on formation and responsibility of next Work Teams. • Consider and choose among supplemental workshop suggestions.	8/31 9/14
Task Force Members	• Prepare for Sept. 27 meeting by reading available materials in advance of the meeting. Meeting materials will be available about one week ahead of time.	9/27

**NEXT TASK FORCE MEETING**

The next meeting is scheduled for Thursday, Sept. 27, 2007. The meeting is tentatively set for 1:00 – 7:00pm, with lunch served from 12:00 – 1:00pm. The location will be announced once a venue is reserved.

Co-Chairs will consider and agree upon agenda items for September 27 meeting. Suggestions include:

- Adopt Co-Chair recommendation (slide #62 of the Compendium of PowerPoint slides) with performance objective.
- Review and clarify the performance objective approach.
- Provide an overview of emissions projections through 2012.
- Invite Task Force members to brainstorm potential air quality initiatives.
- Begin the discussion of implementation and monitoring.
- Present the briefing (Overview of emission control technologies) that was deferred at the 8/14 meeting.
- Review and Adopt revised Screening Criteria.
- Provide a briefing on the Port's financial, legal, and institutional constraints in the planning process, and link it to the constraints of other agencies that might be involved in implementation efforts.
- Provide more insight into the Port's operations, including the Port's strategic vision for the next 5-10 years, and the legal authority of the Port as a landlord, business, and public agency.
- Develop and present a version of the MAQIP Table of Contents that articulates a one-sentence description for each heading, to begin the process of amplifying Plan elements.
- Provide additional information about underlying assumptions relating emissions reductions to health risk reductions in HRAs.