

# Draft Stakeholder Involvement Plan

## Port of Oakland Maritime Air Quality Improvement Plan (Plan)

*For initial review April 10, 2007; comments invited through May 4, 2007  
We request that comments be sent to Jon Mires at CONCUR:  
mires@concurinc.net or 510-649-8008*

### **A. Context for the Port of Oakland Maritime Air Quality Planning Effort**

On April 10, 2007, the Port of Oakland (Port) is launching a stakeholder involvement effort to develop a Port of Oakland Maritime Air Quality Improvement Plan (Plan). The planning effort will be undertaken in collaboration with the Bay Area Air Quality Management District (BAAQMD) to ensure that the Port of Oakland's Plan will be well integrated with efforts to improve air quality in the larger Bay Area.

The Port of Oakland seeks broad participation from a cross-section of Port stakeholders, including neighboring residents and community-based organizations, Port of Oakland tenants and those involved in Port of Oakland Maritime operations, local business interests, public agencies, elected officials and their staffs, labor interests, and environmental advocacy organizations.

### **B. Context for this Draft Stakeholder Involvement Plan**

This document builds on the findings of CONCUR's Draft Stakeholder Assessment Memorandum. We have taken the findings of our Assessment Memorandum in combination with our professional experience to develop the recommendations that follow for structuring stakeholder involvement for the Port of Oakland's Maritime Air Quality Improvement Plan.

We invite comments on this document through May 4, 2007. We intend to finalize the Stakeholder Involvement Plan by May 15, 2007.

Definition of "stakeholder" for this process: *A stakeholder is any person that has an interest in the outcome of the Port of Oakland's planning process to develop a Port of Oakland Maritime Air Quality Improvement Plan.*

### **C. Process Recommendations**

#### **1. Create Multiple Pathways for Stakeholder Involvement in Developing the Plan**

Create several pathways for stakeholders to participate in the development of the Plan, based on their level of interest and available time. These pathways include the following:

- Attending periodic workshops designed to provide progress updates and engage community members in discussion;
- Reading process documents posted on the CONCUR website at:  
<http://www.concurinc.com/portofoakland>

- Participating on the Port of Oakland Maritime Air Quality Task Force (see description below);
- Making nominations to the Port of Oakland Maritime Air Quality Task Force;
- Attending Port of Oakland Maritime Air Quality Task Force meetings;
- Providing comments or suggestions at Port of Oakland Maritime Air Quality Task Force meetings;
- Submitting comments or suggestions at any time during the planning process via mail to Delphine Prévost, Port of Oakland Social Responsibility Division, 530 Water St., Oakland CA 94607.
- Submitting comments during the public comment period following completion of a Draft Port of Oakland Maritime Air Quality Improvement Plan.

## **2. Convene a Port of Oakland Maritime Air Quality Task Force**

A “standing stakeholder group” (we use the phrase “Task Force” in the rest of this document) of about 30 individuals will be formed to provide input on development of the Plan. Task Force members will be asked to make a commitment to attend plenary Task Force meetings and Work Team meetings through February 2008.

Task Force meetings will be agenda-driven and discussion will be focused among Task Force members. Task Force meetings will also be open to the public, and will provide a mechanism for observers to submit comments and suggestions.

## **3. Convene Periodic Workshops to Report Progress and Engage a Large Number of Stakeholders**

As draft elements of the plan are completed, but no less than three times over the duration of the planning process, the Port of Oakland will convene community workshops to:

- Provide updates on the planning process;
- Solicit further suggestions from stakeholders.

These community workshops will be facilitated by CONCUR. We anticipate that breakout groups will be a useful structure in at least some of the community workshops to provide opportunities for broad participation. The CONCUR facilitation team will convene Work Teams of the standing Task Force to identify appropriate workshop meeting venues and times, devise appropriate formats, conduct workshop preparations, and identify breakout group facilitators.

## **4. Focus on Primary Members of Task Force and Potential Consideration of Alternates**

The intent is to focus Task Force meeting discussion on the appointed members to maintain the continuity of deliberations. At their discretion, the Co-Chairs may consider the merits of alternate members of the Task Force.

## **5. Use a Transparent Task Force Nomination and Appointment Process**

See Appendix A – “Port of Oakland Maritime Air Quality Task Force Nomination and Appointment Process”

## **6. Clearly Articulate the Respective Roles and Responsibilities of the Port of Oakland, BAAQMD, and Stakeholders**

### Port of Oakland

- The Port of Oakland will determine the final content of the Plan. Task Force members and other stakeholders will be asked to make recommendations to the Port, but will not be asked to formally vote on the final Plan content. Port staff will provide periodic briefings on Plan development to the Port Commission.

### Bay Area Air Quality Management District (BAAQMD)

- The Air District will be a key partner in linking the Port’s planning process to the Air District’s regional effort, in providing regulatory guidance and technical assistance to the Task Force, and where appropriate, helping to leverage financial support for implementation of the Plan.

### Stakeholders

- Task Force members will serve in an active advisory role. Their charge includes proposing or reviewing options, co-developing Plan elements, ranking measures for consideration, deliberating the merits of proposed actions, and contributing to strategies for implementation, monitoring, and adaptive management.
- Stakeholders who are not members of the Task Force will also participate in an advisory role, engaging according to their preferences through the various pathways available for reviewing Plan documents and providing comments and suggestions.

## **7. Explicitly State the Geographic Focus and Intended Linkage to Regional Air Quality Planning**

The primary geographic focus of the planning effort will be the Port of Oakland Maritime Operations and its immediate environs, including the West Oakland. For the purpose of the planning process, West Oakland is geographically defined as the “3-freeway” area between I-880, I-980, and I-580. The planning process will be explicitly linked to the Bay Area Air Quality Management District’s regional effort through the Co-Chair structure and close coordination between the Port of Oakland’s planning process and the BAAQMD’s emerging regulatory program.

## **8. Define the Role of Task Force Co-Chairs**

The Task Force will be Co-Chaired by three individuals:

Omar Benjamin (Executive Director, Port of Oakland)

Jack Broadbent (Executive Officer, Bay Area Air Quality Management District)

Margaret Gordon (West Oakland Environmental Indicators Project)

Co-Chairs will be members of the Task Force and will be involved in co-planning meetings, providing process suggestions, and reviewing agendas and other key process documents produced by the CONCUR facilitation team.

CONCUR facilitators will guide the discussion at plenary Task Force meetings, prepare key process documents, liaise with port technical consultants, and draft Key Outcomes Memoranda for each Task Force meeting and Community Workshop.

Co-Chairs may appoint a primary and secondary alternate to serve in their absence. These alternates will be the point people for Co-Chair decision-making when the Co-Chair is not available.

### **9. Identify the Expected Duration of Planning Process**

The planning process is expected to last 9-12 months. Task Force members will make an initial commitment from June 2007 through February 2008.

### **10. Set the Anticipated Meeting Frequency**

- Task Force Meetings: Plenary meetings of the Task Force will be about a half day in length and will occur at approximately 6-8 week intervals. As needed, Task Force members may meet in ad hoc Work Teams between plenary Task Force meetings to complete specific tasks.
- Community Workshops: There will be at least three community workshops scheduled over the duration of the planning process. These will be spaced to optimize opportunities for substantive engagement during the workshops.

### **11. Consider the Merits of Convening Stakeholder Joint Fact-Finding Workshops to Build the Knowledge Base for Maritime Air Quality Planning**

The stakeholder involvement process will bring together diverse interests from the West Oakland community, Port Maritime industries, and public agencies. Many representatives from these groups have had limited interaction with one another, and they will be asked to collaborate closely during Plan development.

As the air quality planning process proceeds, CONCUR recommends that the Task Force consider the merits of convening a Joint Fact-Finding workshop to create a venue for representatives of the Port of Oakland, various Maritime industries (rail, trucking, shipping, terminal operations), West Oakland, and the environmental community to share more detailed information about the basis of their interests and to build a foundation of mutual understanding as they consider the merits of various air quality improvement measures.

### **12. Define the Role and Composition of Work Teams**

We recommend that ad hoc Work Teams be formed to meet between plenary Task Force meetings to engage specific topics at a deeper level. These Work Teams will form and meet as-needed to accomplish Plan development; they will not be standing committees of the Task Force.

Work Teams will be charged with completing specific tasks (outlining concepts, drafting text, conducting focused research, deliberating options) and bringing results to the plenary Task Force for deliberation.

All Work Team drafts will be subject to review and deliberation by the full Task Force. Some Work Team products may be incorporated in the Draft Port of Oakland Maritime Air Quality

Improvement Plan; others may not, depending on the deliberations of the full Task Force and consideration by the Port. Composition of the work teams will be guided by:

- Substantive interests and expertise of the Task Force members
- Striving for diverse constituency representation on each Work Team

Until they are presented to the full Task Force, interim Work Team products will be considered internal working drafts, and will not be broadly distributed. Depending on their specific charge, some Work Teams may find it advantageous to include stakeholders who are not serving as Task Force members. The current intent is for the Work Team structure to be flexible and adaptive; the intent is not to create a formal subcommittee structure. Work Teams will be formed as needs arise at the Task Force. Facilitation and guidance of Work Teams will be determined as they are formed; some may be facilitated by CONCUR; others may be guided by Port staff or a Task Force member may serve as lead for a Work Team.

### **13. Describe the Role of the Port's Technical Consultants and Provide Access to Technical Consultants**

The Port of Oakland's technical consultants will plan to attend all plenary Task Force meetings and all Community Workshops. They will provide updates on their work, engage in question and answer sessions with stakeholders, and be available for consultation on technical matters at Task Force Meetings.

The technical consultants will have primary responsibility for technical advising to Port staff. Port staff will in turn prepare the final text of the Plan based on the contributions of and review by Task Force members, Work Teams, and other stakeholders.

### **14. Create Ground Rules for the Conduct of the Task Force**

CONCUR recommends that the Task Force adopt a set of Ground Rules to create clear expectations and a framework for their interactions. Suggested areas of focus for the Ground Rules include Representation, Participation and Collaboration, Media Contact, Information Sharing, Work Team Protocols, Identifying and Valuing Alternatives, and Commitment to Process. CONCUR will work with Task Force members to create these Ground Rules.

### **15. Build on Past Efforts and Consider Potential "Source Documents"**

While the Port of Oakland Maritime Air Quality Task Force would be the first group charged specifically with working to develop a Port of Oakland Maritime Air Quality Improvement Plan, there are several groups that have done previous work to analyze air quality issues in the Oakland area and recommend strategies for air quality improvement. Examples include the West Oakland Toxics Reduction Collaborative, the City of Oakland Port Task Force, the Ditching Dirty Diesel Collaborative, and the West Oakland Environmental Indicators Project.

In considering possible strategies for air quality improvement, there also exist several potential "Source Documents" that may lend useful goals, targets, and strategies to the Port of Oakland planning effort. Examples include the San Pedro Bay Ports Clean Air Action Plan (Ports of Los Angeles and Long Beach) and the 2006 California Air Resources Board Emission Reduction Plan for Ports and Goods Movement in California.

CONCUR recommends that an early task in the planning effort be to compile a comprehensive list of past efforts and potential "Source Documents" for consideration and possible incorporation into the Port of Oakland Maritime Air Quality Improvement Plan.

**16. Closely Coordinate the Port of Oakland Maritime Air Quality Planning Process with Existing and Emerging Regulations**

CONCUR recommends that the Port of Oakland and stakeholders closely coordinate Plan development to incorporate existing and emerging local, state, and federal regulations. New rules from the California Air Resources Board significantly affecting ports could be completed in 2007, as well as an emerging port regulatory framework from the Bay Area Air Quality Management District that is expected to be in place in the first half of 2008.

**17. Designate a Port of Oakland Liaison for the Maritime Air Quality Improvement Plan:**

Delphine Prévost in the Port of Oakland Social Responsibility Division (dprevost@portoakland.com and 510-627-1141) will be the liaison for all matters relating to the content of Port of Oakland's Maritime Air Quality Improvement Plan and for communication regarding Plan preparation.

**D. Comments Invited on this Draft Stakeholder Involvement Plan**

The Port of Oakland and CONCUR invite comments on this Draft Stakeholder Involvement Plan through **May 4, 2007**.

Please submit comments to Jon Mires at CONCUR:
--

Email: mires@concurinc.net
----------------------------

Telephone: 510-649-8008
-------------------------

We intend to finalize this document by May 15, 2007. The final Stakeholder Involvement Plan will be posted on the CONCUR website at <http://www.concurinc.net/portofoakland>