

Date: April 19, 2007

To: Attendees, April 10, 2007 Port of Oakland Maritime Air Quality Plan Kickoff Meeting

From: Scott McCreary and Jon Mires, CONCUR, Inc.

Re: Key Outcomes and Key Points of Discussion – April 10, 2007 Port of Oakland Maritime Air Quality Improvement Plan Kickoff Meeting

I. Meeting Participants

The meeting was convened by the planning process Co-Chairs:

Omar Benjamin, Executive Director, Port of Oakland

Jack Broadbent, Executive Officer, Bay Area Air Quality Management District

Margaret Gordon, West Oakland Environmental Indicators Project

Approximately 80 people attended the meeting, including West Oakland residents, public agency staff, environmental advocates, technical consulting firms, Port tenants and customers, public health advocates, community-based organizations, and staff of elected officials. Port Commissioners Anthony Batarse, Mark McClure, and David Kramer also attended portions of the meeting.

The facilitation team included Scott McCreary, Jon Mires, and Amy LeBlanc of CONCUR, Inc.

II. Key Points of Discussion and Presentation (in the order presented/discussed)

A. Port Maritime Focus: Parameters of the Planning Effort

The MAQIP will address emission sources within the Port's Maritime Operations Area and their effects on air quality in West Oakland (defined geographically for this process as the area bounded by the 880, 980, and 580 freeways). Refer to slide #3 of the Port's PowerPoint Presentation Slides, available at <http://www.concurinc.com/portofoakland>.

B. Sources, Pollutants, and Technical Steps in the Planning Process

Refer to slides #9-14 of the Port's PowerPoint Presentation Slides, available at <http://www.concurinc.com/portofoakland>.

C. CONCUR Stakeholder Assessment Findings

Refer to slides #5-14 of CONCUR's PowerPoint Presentation Slides, available at <http://www.concurinc.com/portofoakland/>.

D. Presentation of CONCUR's Draft Stakeholder Involvement Plan

Refer to slides #15-25 of CONCUR's PowerPoint Presentation Slides, available at <http://www.concurinc.com/portofoakland/>.

CONCUR's working definition of "stakeholder" for this process:

A stakeholder is any person that has an interest in the outcome of the Port of Oakland's planning process to develop a Port of Oakland Maritime Air Quality Improvement Plan.

E. Task Force Nomination Process

The Port of Oakland and the Co-Chairs launched a Task Force recruitment and nomination process. Nomination forms were distributed at the meeting and are available on the CONCUR website at <http://www.concurinc.com/portofoakland>. Nominations will be accepted through May 10, 2007. Refer to slides #19-21 of CONCUR's PowerPoint Presentation, available at <http://www.concurinc.com/portofoakland>.

F. Planning Process: Key Topics of Discussion

Participants posed a series of questions and offered suggestions on several key areas of the proposed MAQIP process.

Process Details that Merit Refinement

1. Plan Adoption Process
 - a. What is the sequence of steps by which the Port Commission will be engaged in finalizing or adopting the Plan?
 - b. What process models can be incorporated to bring Task Force recommendations directly to the Port Commission? Might there be a scenario where the Task Force forwards recommendations to the Port Commission that are not supported by staff?
 - c. How will decisions be made as to what text will be included in the final Plan? Might multiple options on some issues be carried forward for Commission consideration?
 - d. Will the Plan be subject to CEQA Review?
2. What steps can be taken to make the West Oakland community broadly aware of the Task Force nomination opportunity?
3. What specific formats will be used to provide "substantive deliberation" opportunities for Task Force members and other stakeholders?
4. How can explicit terms of community interest such as "environmental justice" and "economic equity" be incorporated into the charge of the Task Force? How can these considerations be effectively incorporated in the planning process?

The CONCUR team noted that additional refinements to the process design will be layered in over the next month and discussed at the June 11 meeting of the Task Force.

With respect to the question on potential methods to determine which text should be carried forward into the Plan and then to the Port Commission, CONCUR described several available methods they have used in past collaborative planning processes:

1. Develop a menu of multiple options and use straw voting to clarify preferences;
2. Carry forward multiple options for Commission consideration;
3. Devise ranking or prioritization exercises.

Harold Jones, Deputy Director, External Affairs for the Port of Oakland, speaking on behalf of Co-Chair Omar Benjamin, stated that he envisions the Co-Chairs presenting regular progress updates on the planning process to the Port Maritime Committee. He also expressed support for forwarding the text of Task Force recommendations to the Port Commission.

Process Suggestions Offered by Participants

1. The Co-Chairs and Facilitation Team should strive to schedule public meetings at times and locations that are convenient for community members. Particular consideration should be given to meeting in West Oakland and to holding meetings in the evening.
2. The list of meeting attendees should be compiled and made available to those who attended.
3. Meeting documents prepared by CONCUR and the Planning team should be posted online for public access.

4. One method for the Port to demonstrate its commitment to the Task Force would be to charge the Task Force with setting the goals for the Plan and the criteria for choosing options.
5. At the introduction of Co-Chair Margaret Gordon, Swati Prakash of the Pacific Institute offered several process recommendations developed by the Pacific Institute and the West Oakland Environmental Indicators Project:
 - a. Formalize the Task Force role so there are clear linkages and between Task Force recommendations and elements of the final Plan.
 - b. Structure technical deliberations so that technical consultants and stakeholders work side-by-side.
 - c. Consider a broad range of criteria in evaluating potential Plan measures.
 - d. Prioritize community and public health considerations in considering strategies and Plan elements.

Refer to the Proposal for a Collaborative Approach to the Port Air Quality Improvement Plan (authored by the West Oakland Environmental Indicators Project and the Pacific Institute), at <http://www.concurinc.com/portofoakland>.

G. Overview of some Key Inputs to the Plan

Agency staff, Port staff, and Port technical consultants presented an overview of some key inputs to the planning process, including:

1. **Port of Oakland Emissions Inventory** - expected to be completed within the next month and will be publicly available on the Port of Oakland website.

West Oakland Human Health Risk Assessment (HRA) - draft report for public review is expected to be completed in early- to mid-Fall, 2007. The scope of the MAQIP is not intended to exactly mirror the scope of the HRA. The primary health outcome associated with diesel particulate matter is cancer, and this will be a main focus of the HRA, consistent with experience at the Ports of Los Angeles and Long Beach. The decision to structure the analysis using average emissions was based on the Air Resources Board's staff experience with the Ports of Los Angeles and Long Beach, and is linked to the issue focus on chronic cancer risk from diesel emissions.

2. Evolving Regulatory Programs

Jack Broadbent of the Bay Area Air Quality Management District (BAAQMD) described the BAAQMD's emerging regulatory program, the Green Ports Initiative, which is a regional regulatory program directed at the five ports in the Bay Area. An overview of this Initiative is available at <http://www.concurinc.com/portofoakland>.

Bill Sylte, consultant to the Port, provided an overview of the Air Resources Board Goods Movement Emission Reduction Plan, which appears on slides 15-18 of the Port's PowerPoint Presentation Slides, available at <http://www.concurinc.com/portofoakland>.

Matt Haber of the EPA also described 3 key developments at the federal and international levels that may inform or affect the MAQIP process, including proposed rules to regulate small marine vessels and locomotives and the MARPOL Convention's consideration of strict rules on fuel sulfur content in marine vessels.

3. Infrastructure Bond Funding

Roberta Reinstein of the Port of Oakland described the Infrastructure Bond funding process, which appears on slides #19-21 of the Port's PowerPoint Presentation Slides, available at <http://www.concurinc.com/portofoakland>.

H. Documents Available Online

Project documents prepared by CONCUR and the Port will be posted on both the CONCUR and Port of Oakland websites:

1. CONCUR website

CONCUR will post all meeting documents prepared by CONCUR at <http://www.concurinc.com/portofoakland>. We will also post meeting handouts prepared by others when possible, and indicate their authorship and linkage to the MAQIP process.

2. Port of Oakland website

The Port will post all Port documents at <http://www.portofoakland.com/enviro/m/>.

III. Summary of Next Steps

Responsible Party	Action	Due Date
Task Force Nominations		
Co-Chairs and Facilitation Team	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Develop outreach strategy to broadly notice Task Force nomination process Implement outreach strategy 	Week of April 16
Interested stakeholders	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Submit Task Force nominations to Delphine Prévost at the Port of Oakland 	May 10
Co-Chairs	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Review nominations based on selection criteria 	Week of May 14
Omar Benjamin	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Appoint Task Force members 	by May 20
Port staff	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Announce Task Force membership 	by May 20
Key Inputs to MAQIP Process		
BAAQMD	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Provide updates on process to implement Green Ports Initiative 	June 11
Port, Co-Chairs, and Technical Consultants	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Track legislative and regulatory developments including ARB rule development regarding main engine fuel requirements and shore power, EPA rule development regarding C1 and C2 marine engines and locomotives, and MARPOL Convention outcome on sulfur content in marine vessels Track ARB's HRA progress on emission inventory reports 	Ongoing By June 11
Port Technical Consultants	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Analyze current and projected future conditions Identify potential control measures Provide progress update and information for Task Force consideration 	Ongoing Ongoing June 11
Stakeholder Assessment Memorandum		
Facilitation team	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Distribute Draft Stakeholder Assessment Memorandum to interviewees 	April 12
Interviewees	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Submit comments and clarifying questions to Jon Mires at CONCUR: mires@concurinc.net 	April 26
Facilitation team	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Digest and synthesize suggested revisions Finalize Stakeholder Assessment Memorandum Distribute final Stakeholder Assessment Memorandum to interviewees Post final Stakeholder Assessment Memorandum on CONCUR website 	Week of April 30 May 4 May 4 May 4

Stakeholder Involvement Plan		
Interested stakeholders	• Submit comments to Jon Mires at CONCUR: mires@concurinc.net	May 4
Facilitation Team	• Digest and synthesize comments • Finalize Stakeholder Involvement Plan • Post final Stakeholder Involvement Plan on CONCUR website	Week of May 7 May 15 May 15
Future meeting logistics		
Co-Chairs and Facilitation Team	• Arrange for microphone at next meeting • Coordinate timing and venue with community liaisons	June 11 June 11
Process Refinement		
Port, Co-Chairs, and Facilitation Team	• Refine the description of the steps to Plan adoption • Digest and consider process questions and suggestions described in Section F. above • Outline key issues for deliberation at the June 11 meeting	Ongoing, through late-May
Document Distribution		
BAAQMD	Provide 2-page description of BAAQMD “Green Ports Initiative” for posting on project websites	Week of April 16
Facilitation Team	• Post CONCUR-generated meeting handouts on the CONCUR website • Post the Key Outcomes Memorandum on the CONCUR website • Distribute a link to the Key Outcomes Memorandum to all April 10 meeting attendees via email.	April 12 April 20 April 20
Port	• Post all materials developed or prepared for the planning process on the Port of Oakland website	Week of April 16

The Next Meeting

June 11 is identified as the first meeting of the Port of Oakland Maritime Air Quality Task Force. The CONCUR facilitation team will work with the Co-Chairs to determine the time and location. As well, CONCUR will work with the Co-Chairs to outline the agenda, track progress on the Port technical consultants’ work, and monitor the evolving regulatory framework.

IV. Meeting Handouts

A. CONCUR-generated documents:

Meeting handouts prepared by CONCUR are available in PDF format on the CONCUR website at <http://www.concurinc.com/portofoakland>. We will also post meeting handouts generated by others when possible, and will indicate authorship of all documents posted on the CONCUR website.

B. Port-generated documents:

Meeting handouts prepared by the Port of Oakland will soon be available on the Port’s website at <http://www.portofoakland.com/environm/>.

C. Other Materials Introduced

- Proposal for a Collaborative Approach to the Port Air Quality Improvement Plan (prepared by the Pacific Institute and the West Oakland Environmental Indicators Project) – available at <http://www.concurinc.com/portofoakland>.
- San Pedro Bay Ports Clean Air Action Plan FACT SHEET (prepared by the Ports of Los Angeles and Long Beach, provided by the Port of Oakland)